Laws of Sanctification of the New Month, Chapter 7 (Auto Translated)

English

Auto Translated

Shiur Overview

Summary of Shiur – Laws of Sanctifying the New Month, Chapter 7

Introduction to the Chapter: The Three Steps of Calendar Calculation

The Rambam's Approach

Simple Meaning: Chapter 7 is the second of three chapters (6, 7, 8) that build the entire calendar calculation. The calendar works **from Tishrei to Tishrei**, and the goal is to know when Rosh Chodesh Tishrei (Rosh Hashanah) falls.

Novel Points:

1. **The Three Steps:**

- **Step 1 (Chapter 6)** – Calculate the **molad ha'emtza'i** (mean conjunction) of the month of Tishrei for each year, according to the rule of 29 days, 12 hours, and 793 parts for each month. **The molad itself is not yet Rosh Chodesh** – molad and Rosh Chodesh are two separate things.

- **Step 2 (Chapter 7)** – The laws/rules of when we **postpone** Rosh Chodesh Tishrei from the day of the molad to the next day or even further.

- **Step 3 (Chapter 8)** – How to establish Rosh Chodesh for **every month** of the entire year, according to fixed rules.

2. **The entire calculation is deterministic:** According to the Rambam, the entire calculation – all three steps – is one hundred percent deterministic. There is no discretion or room for a beis din to do otherwise. If one knows the rules of the three chapters, one knows when every Rosh Chodesh is **from the beginning of history until Mashiach will come** (when we will return to sanctification based on testimony). The Ra'avad perhaps holds differently, but the Rambam's approach is that everything is fixed rules.

3. **Distinction between calendar calculation and the time of testimony:** The calculation of the molad ha'emtza'i has almost nothing to do with what was done in the time of testimony (according to the Rambam). In the time of testimony, one needed to know a different calculation – when the moon can be **seen** (which we will learn later in other chapters), in order to know whether the witness is telling the truth or lying. The calculation of the molad ha'emtza'i is an **approximate calculation** that is not built on seeing the moon.

4. **Meaning of "ein kovin":** When the Rambam says "ein kovin Rosh Chodesh Tishrei," he doesn't mean that someone stands and formally "establishes" it. The Rambam holds that technically the beis din of all Israel makes the calculation, but "ein kovin" means practically: if you want to make a calendar, do the calculation of the molad, apply the rules, and know when Rosh Hashanah is. It's a **revelation of the matter**, not any external establishment. This stands in contrast to sanctifying the month based on testimony, where there was a whole drama – who establishes it, the Sanhedrin, the sages in Eretz Yisrael. By the calendar, it never says that a specific authority issues it.

5. **Postponements and sanctification based on testimony:** Simply, the postponements (adu rosh, molad zaken, gatrad, betu takpat) were not in effect when sanctifying based on testimony, because then one goes by the testimony. The postponements are only a law in the calculation of the fixed calendar. There is an opinion that in the time of sanctification based on testimony, the beis din had "power" – they could accept or not accept testimony, and could be strict with the testimony, which effectively enabled similar results.

6. **Rosh Hashanah and Rosh Chodesh:** In Tractate Rosh Hashanah are the laws of sanctifying the month, which shows that Rosh Hashanah is actually the "Rosh Chodesh of all Roshei Chadashim." Although Nissan is "the first month" (according to the verse "this month shall be for you the beginning of months"), the calendar goes from Tishrei. This is not a contradiction – Nissan is first for months, but Tishrei is the beginning of the year-count. Once one establishes when Rosh Chodesh Tishrei is, one can automatically calculate all the festivals of the year, because Elul always has 29 days in our calendar, and the remaining rules (Chapter 8) follow automatically.

Law 1 (Law 7 in the Rambam) – Postponement #1: Lo Adu Rosh

The Rambam's Words

"We never establish Rosh Chodesh Tishrei according to this calculation on Sunday, Wednesday, or Friday. Their mnemonic is adu. Rather, when the molad of Tishrei falls on one of these three days, we establish Rosh Chodesh on the following day. How so? If the molad was on Sunday, we establish Rosh Chodesh Tishrei on Monday. If the molad is on Wednesday, we establish Rosh Chodesh on Thursday. If the molad is on Friday, we establish Rosh Chodesh on Sunday."

Simple Meaning

When the molad of Tishrei falls on Sunday (1), Wednesday (4), or Friday (6), we postpone Rosh Chodesh Tishrei to the **next day**. The mnemonic is **"lo adu rosh"**.

Novel Points and Notes

1. **The source of the mnemonic "edua harosh":** The mnemonic doesn't come from the Gemara as "lo adu rosh," but from a **verse in the Book of Ezra (8:17)**: **"va'atzaveh osam al Edua harosh"** – Ezra commanded someone named **Ido** (ayin-dalet-vav), who was the head of a group of Jews during Ezra's aliyah. The hint is: **"Edua" is not the "rosh"** – i.e., Rosh Hashanah doesn't fall on ayin-dalet-vav. Therefore, one should actually say **"lo edua rosh"** (with an ayin), not "lo adu rosh".

2. **A note on grammar:** When people see the word "adu" without vowel points, one assumes the vav is a vowel

(shuruk/cholam), but it can just as well be a vav that is read as a vav (like "edua").

3. **The rule applies only to Rosh Chodesh Tishrei:** The rule of lo adu applies **specifically to the month of Tishrei**. The reasons are relevant to Rosh Hashanah, Yom Kippur, Hoshana Rabbah, and the like. **However** – because **the entire calendar begins from Tishrei**, one can technically say that other months (like Kislev) also have rules that align with the calculation – but this comes out **as a result** of having already established Tishrei, not as separate rules. Also **lo badu Pesach** – Pesach doesn't come out on certain days, which comes out automatically from lo adu rosh.

Law 7 (Continuation) – Postponement #2: Molad Zaken (Molad That Falls at Midday or After Midday)

The Rambam's Words

"Similarly, if the molad is at midday or later than midday... we establish Rosh Chodesh on the following day."

Simple Meaning

If the molad of Tishrei occurs at midday (hour 18 from the beginning of the night) or later, we postpone Rosh Chodesh to the next day. This is a second reason (in addition to adu rosh) why we postpone Rosh Chodesh Tishrei. Normally there would be no difference when in the day the molad is – that day is Rosh Chodesh. But for Tishrei, if the molad is at midday or later, we postpone.

Novel Points

1. **"Midday" = hour 18:** The Rambam explains that "midday" means hour 18 from the beginning of the day (which begins at sunset). This is midday – six hours into the day, but eighteen hours from the night before.

2. **Even one part:** Even one part (of 1080 parts in an hour) before midday – we make Rosh Chodesh that same day (if it's not adu).

Law 7 (Continuation) – Combination of Two Postponements: Postponing by Two Days

The Rambam's Words

"If the following day is one of the days of adu, it is postponed to the day after that, and Rosh Chodesh will be established on the third day from the day of the molad."

Simple Meaning

When the molad is after midday, and the next day is adu, we postpone by two days.

Novel Points

1. **Examples from the Rambam:**

- Molad on Shabbos at midday (sign: 7, 18) – cannot be Sunday (1), therefore we establish on Monday.

- Molad on Tuesday at midday or later – cannot be Wednesday (4), therefore we establish on Thursday.

2. **Question about adding two days:** If we postpone by two days, does that add two days to the previous year? The answer: In practice it doesn't add, because the entire calendar is already set up – all the months were set up so that it works out. Elul remains 29 days. Each year we calculate the calendar fresh – we calculate from molad baharad (or add from last year), everything built on the calculation of 29 days, 12 hours, 793 parts for each month since the six days of creation. Therefore it can never happen that Rosh Hashanah "next year will be three days later" – each year is a fresh calculation.

Law 8 – Postponement #3: Gatrad (Molad Tishrei in a Simple Year)

The Rambam's Words

"The molad of Tishrei that comes out in the calculation... on Tuesday night at nine hours... and forty parts of the tenth hour (sign gatrad)... or more, if it was a simple year..."

Simple Meaning

If the molad of Tishrei comes out Tuesday night, nine hours and 204 parts (gatrad = 3, 9, 204), or later, and it's a simple year – we postpone Rosh Chodesh.

Novel Points

1. **The Rambam doesn't give the reason why** – one can learn it as it stands.

2. **What "simple year" means here:** There's a discussion of what "simple year" means – the year we're entering (from Tishrei to Tishrei), not the previous year. The conclusion is that simple year means that the coming year (from this Tishrei) will be a simple year (not intercalated). This stands in contrast to the next postponement which speaks of "departing from an intercalated year." All years are counted from Tishrei to Tishrei for this purpose.

3. **Question about the necessity of the postponements:** If one can already calculate from the previous year's Rosh Hashanah when next year's Rosh Hashanah will be (according to the rules of Chapter 8), why does one need to know the postponements separately? The answer: Perhaps it means that those rules of Chapter 8 were calculated according to this – one takes the postponements into account.

Law 8 (Continuation) – Postponement #4: Betu Takpat (Departing from an Intercalated Year)

The Rambam's Words

"If the molad of Tishrei comes out on Monday at three hours of the day and five hundred eighty-nine parts, and the year is simple following an intercalated year – we don't establish Rosh Chodesh on Monday but on Tuesday."

Simple Meaning

When the molad of Tishrei comes out Monday (day two), 15 hours (three hours of the day = 15 hours from the beginning of the night), 589 parts, and it's a simple year coming after an intercalated year – we postpone Rosh Hashanah from Monday to Tuesday. The sign is 2, 15, 589.

Novel Points

1. **"Three hours of the day" = 15 hours from the beginning of the night** (as earlier in the calculations). The sign 2, 15, 589 stands for: 2 = Monday, 15 = 15 hours, 589 = 589 parts.

2. **"Departing from intercalated"** means that the previous Nissan was intercalated – i.e., the year we're coming from was an intercalated year.

The Rule of One Part (Relevant to Postponements #3 and #4)

The Rambam's words: "Even one part less – for example if its sign was gatrag but less than this, we establish it on Tuesday. Similarly, if the molad departing from intercalated was one part less, for example betu takpach – we establish it on Monday."

Simple Meaning: The postponements only apply when it's exactly that measure or more. If even one part is missing – we don't apply the postponement.

Summary of All Postponements – How to Establish Rosh Chodesh Tishrei

The Rambam's Words

"Anyone who wants to know the method of establishing Rosh Chodesh Tishrei... should calculate and know the molad on which day and how many hours and how many parts... and the day of the molad is always the day of establishment, unless it was one of these four postponements... we don't establish on the day of the molad but on the following day or the day after that."

Simple Meaning

Calculate the molad (Chapter 6), and the day of the molad is the day of establishment – unless one of the four postponements applies: (1) adu rosh, (2) molad zaken (midday or after midday), (3) gatrad in a simple year, (4) betu takpat departing from intercalated. In such a case, we postpone one or two days.

Law 7 (End) – The Reason for Lo Adu Rosh and All Postponements

The Rambam's Words

"Why don't we establish according to this calculation on the days of adu? Because this calculation is for the conjunction of the moon with the sun in their mean motion, not in their true position... therefore they made a fixed day and a postponement day in order to coincide with the day of the true conjunction."

"The essence of these other four postponements is this principle that we said, that this calculation is the mean motion."

Simple Meaning

The Rambam explains that our calculation is built on the mean motion (average motion) of the sun and moon, not on their true position. Therefore, postponements were instituted – that three days of the week should be established, and four days we postpone – so that the average will be closer to the truth. **All four postponements stem from the same principle** – that the calculation is only an average.

Novel Points and Explanations

1. **"Conjunction" = conjunction:** The molad (conjunction of the moon with the sun) is when the sun and moon stand in the same place. Our calculation figures this according to mean motion, but the true conjunction is different.

2. **Why the true molad is usually later:** At Tishrei, usually the true calculation is later than the mean calculation. But one cannot postpone by half a day (because "complete days" – we only count whole days). Therefore, they made it so that every other day we postpone – 3 days we establish (2, 3, 5), 4 days we postpone (1, 4, 6, Shabbos) – so that on average it becomes closer to the truth.

3. **The Rambam's proof: "For the molad will be on Tuesday night and it will be postponed to Thursday"** – many times the mean molad comes out Tuesday night, but when we look at the moon, we see it only Thursday night (Wednesday night), and sometimes not even until Friday night. This proves that the mean molad is three days earlier than the true molad. **"For the sun and moon didn't truly conjunct until Thursday"** – the true conjunction was only Thursday. The postponements (like molad zaken – the fourth hour of the day postpones by two days) bring Rosh Chodesh closer to the true conjunction. Without the postponements, the gap between the mean molad and true molad would remain large.

4. **Practical reasons why it matters:** If Rosh Chodesh is too early, one can still see the old moon on Rosh Chodesh, which is a "shame." If too late, it can be two-three days from Rosh Chodesh until we see the new moon at all – also a shame. The goal is that the calculation shouldn't be too far from reality.

5. **The difference between true molad and mean molad – only between months, not years (according to commentators):** The mean calculation is accurate after a **whole year** – the lunar year (354 days etc.) is exactly right. The difference between true molad and mean molad is only a difference **between months**, not between years. Because the moon doesn't travel exactly the same each month – in Nissan a bit longer, in other months shorter. But after twelve months together it comes out exactly. The problem is only that Rosh Hashanah, which is in the middle of the years, can come out when the monthly true molad is different from the mean.

6. **What is meant when we announce the molad in shul:** The molad that we announce in shul is only a **mean** – it's not the real molad, just a calculated molad. The moon doesn't have to follow the molad we announce at all. We announce it so we'll know when Rosh Chodesh is, not so we can search for the moon. Interesting: Rosh Hashanah is the only time we **don't** announce any molad (no Rosh Chodesh blessing), but this is precisely the only month where the molad is actually relevant (for the postponements). All other months – Rosh Chodesh is automatically determined after Rosh Hashanah.

7. **Why the Rambam only explains the reason for lo adu rosh (and not for molad zaken, gatrad, or betu takpat):** Several reasons are suggested:

- (a) The Rambam's goal in this chapter is practical – how to make a calendar, not to learn the reasons for the commandments of the calendar. He holds that it's "enough and more" to know how to calculate.

- (b) By lo adu it seems arbitrary (why can't Rosh Hashanah be Sunday?), therefore the Rambam feels a need to explain. By the other postponements, when one sees a precise calculation, one understands that there must be a reason.

- (c) The Rambam has an interest in teaching that the mean calculation is not the true calculation – which is important for later when he will teach the true conjunction.

8. **All postponements stem from one principle:** The Rambam reduces all four postponements to one reason – that

the calculation is only an average. This is a novel point, because he reduces all postponements to one principle.

The Ra'avad's Critique on Law 7

The Ra'avad's Introduction

"Said Avraham, because this author is very protective and boasts of this wisdom and in his eyes he has reached its perfection... and I am not one of the people of astronomical wisdom for even my teachers didn't reach it... but I didn't enter into his words to examine the matter."

Novel Points

1. **Why does the Ra'avad have almost no critiques on nineteen chapters of the Laws of Sanctifying the Month?** The Ra'avad's method is: he learns the Gemara and questions the Rambam. Here he didn't know the Gemara of this topic (astronomy/calculation), therefore he couldn't make critiques.

The Ra'avad's First Question

"What sin did adu commit that the molad should never truly be on it, that it should always be postponed? And what merit did bagahaz earn that it should be on it and not be postponed?"

Simple Meaning: If the Rambam says we must postpone because the true molad is later, why only by adu? What did adu sin that the molad should never be on it? And what did bagahaz merit that it should never be postponed? According to the Rambam's reasoning, we would **never** have to establish on the day of the molad – we would always have to postpone.

Novel Point (suggestion to answer): The Rambam doesn't say we must **always** postpone. It's enough that in a large percentage of cases (for example 70%) the postponements bring Rosh Chodesh closer to the true molad. It's not that adu is never correct, but that in most cases postponing brings a better result.

The Ra'avad's Second Question

Simple Meaning: The Ra'avad brings that **we have a tradition (Gemara)** that the postponements have a different reason: **lo adu rosh – because of the day of aravah** (Hoshana Rabbah shouldn't come out on Shabbos, so we can do hoshanot), **and because of Yom Kippur that it shouldn't come either on Friday or on Saturday night** (Yom Kippur on Friday – we can't cook for Shabbos; Saturday night – we can't prepare for the fast). These are the true reasons for lo adu rosh, not the Rambam's reasoning about the true molad.

How to Reconcile the Rambam with the Gemara

Novel Point – A Critical Distinction: The Gemara speaks of a time when the month was sanctified based on testimony. In those times, they sometimes **intercalated Elul** – i.e., they actively postponed Rosh Hashanah by making Elul longer – for practical reasons (because of vegetables, because of an inciter, because of the day of aravah). This aligns with what we learned in previous chapters, that even in the time of sanctification based on testimony, they sometimes "intercalated" the month for certain reasons.

But the Rambam speaks of something different: The Rambam doesn't speak of intercalating Elul. He speaks of rules in the calendar – how the calendar controls which day Rosh Hashanah comes out. In the Gemara's times there wasn't this problem, because they didn't make any molad at all – they used testimony. The Rambam's approach is that we don't "actually" postpone Rosh Hashanah, but we control the calendar so that Rosh Hashanah will never come out adu.

Therefore the Rambam is not a contradiction to the Gemara: Both – the Rambam and the Ra'avad's teachers – took the literal words of the Gemara and adapted them for the calendar system, but maintained the same rule that Rosh Hashanah doesn't come out adu. But the Rambam doesn't go at all with the Gemara's mechanism (intercalating Elul), but with a completely different mechanism (calendar rules). "It's not in the Gemara doesn't fight with the Gemara" – the Rambam doesn't fight with the Gemara, he just gives an additional explanation.

Criticism of other commentators: Some commentators write as if the Ra'avad says that "it's stated in the Gemara" (that the postponements are stated in the Gemara). But the Ra'avad doesn't say it's stated in the Gemara – he knows the Gemara speaks of a different context. His claim is only that the Rambam's explanation (with the true molad) is not correct.

How to reconcile both approaches: Both – the Rambam and the Ra'avad's teachers – agree that we must exclude half the time (i.e., three of six days) for Rosh Hashanah. The dispute is only in this: why specifically the three days adu? The Rambam gives a systematic reason (based on the molad), while the Ra'avad's tradition seeks other reasons.

[Digression: It's noted that "I'm fortunate that they don't intercalate Elul today, because the Lithuanians would certainly intercalate Elul every year" – a joke about the Lithuanian custom to learn more.]

Full Transcript

Laws of Sanctifying the New Month, Chapter 7 – General Rules of Rosh Hashanah Postponements

Introduction: Structure of the Calculation and the Transition from Nissan to Tishrei

Speaker 1:

Good. We are learning the Rambam, Laws of Sanctifying the New Month, Chapter 7. Eleven, very good. We are now in the days before Rosh Hashanah, so this chapter will tell us when one must calculate, specifically to establish the month of Tishrei, to establish when Rosh Hashanah should be.

In the previous chapters, we mainly spoke about establishing Nissan. Nissan was about intercalating, Nissan wasn't the last, but one before that was when one intercalates, when one makes a leap year, now it dealt with "hachodesh hazeh lachem" (this month shall be for you). But now, baruch Hashem, we're speaking about Rosh Hashanah.

In the previous chapter we discussed the order, Rabbi Yitzchak explained so nicely the order of how one can calculate the moladot (lunar conjunctions) of all years. This chapter we will learn when one establishes Rosh Hashanah, yes? Right.

The Three Steps of Calendar Calculation

What we're going to do is, rabbosai (gentlemen), we're learning now, we're in the middle of learning three chapters, chapters 5, 6, 7, 8, learning the laws of how to make a calendar. Whoever wants to know which day of the week, basically, because more than that isn't really in doubt, which day of the week will be Rosh Hashanah or Rosh Chodesh of any year? He must calculate the calculations that are in chapters 6, 7, 8, today when we don't have witnesses.

When there used to be a beis din (rabbinical court), one had to look at the moon as well, and not calculate the calculation, because the calculation according to the Rambam has almost nothing to do with what was done in the time of witnesses, because in the time of witnesses one had to know a different calculation that we'll learn later, because that's when the moon can be seen, because then one needs to know if the witnesses are lying and so forth. But the calculation we're learning now is essentially an approximate calculation, which is essentially not built on when one can see the moon.

But today there is like a halacha l'Moshe miSinai (law given to Moses at Sinai), or according to the Rambam's interpretation, that Rosh Chodesh goes according to this calculation. Now, the calculation is a somewhat lengthy calculation, it takes three chapters to explain. There are three, like general rules, parts of this calculation.

Step 1: Calculating the Molad (Chapter 6)

The first part we've already learned. There is a calculation called molad hamatzua (average conjunction), which we learned in the previous chapter, how to calculate it. It tells us, when will the molad be each month?

The Rambam says, we start from the month of Tishrei. The calendar generally is established with the year that begins from Tishrei until Tishrei until Tishrei. You say Nissan isn't how we make the calendar, our calendar works with Tishrei to Tishrei.

And therefore, what we learned, all the calculations we said when the molad will be, came to the month of Tishrei. Afterwards, from Tishrei one simply calculates, from Tishrei you can calculate twelve months of 29 days, 12 hours, 793 chalakim from Tishrei onwards for each month, to know when the molad is each month.

That's only step 1 of the calendar. Why? Because the molad and Rosh Chodesh are two different things. If you want to know when Rosh Chodesh will be, it's not enough to know when the molad is, at least to know when the molad is. That's why we announce in shul beforehand when the molad is. But actually, afterwards one must announce in shul the next two chapters, which can tell us when Rosh Chodesh actually is.

Steps 2 and 3: Laws of Establishing Rosh Chodesh

That is, if it were naturally that if one only knew from the molad, one would say the next morning from the molad or the next day from the molad. But there are additional laws when we establish Rosh Chodesh so that there should be a proper order of Rosh Chodesh days.

Speaker 2:

I don't know what "naturally" means. The entire calculation, from beginning to end, is the calculation according to which either Moshe Rabbeinu or the Sages who made the calendar established that this is how one should make Rosh Chodesh. There is no "naturally." Naturally one doesn't do it according to the molad, naturally one does it according to the sighting. And the molad, certainly not the molad hamatzua, has nothing to do with the sighting.

Discussion: The Calculation is Halacha, Not Nature

Speaker 1:

So, in total the calculation, in order for the calculation to work, various things. If we get into the reasons, the actual reasons aren't so important, because the purpose of these chapters is to know what the calendar is. These are laws of making a calendar, or knowing when Rosh Chodesh is.

Laws of Sanctifying the New Month is like a mitzvah, just as every mitzvah is to sanctify months, to know when Rosh Chodesh is. There are two ways to do this mitzvah. One is through seeing the moon, witnesses, and the calculation is the calculation. This is what Moshe Rabbeinu taught, or Hillel Hazaken taught, whatever it is, that this is how one makes Rosh Chodesh.

But the calculation has three steps. You can have two steps or three steps of the calculation. The Rambam makes it very clear. The first step is, one calculates the molad hamatzua, and calculates when the molad will be. But that still says nothing. It's nothing at all. Now it's pure calculations, there they don't have opinions. And afterwards, when making Rosh Chodesh there are already laws, not just calculations, there are laws.

Speaker 2:

No, I don't agree. It's also the laws, it's also pure calculations. There's nothing one needs to think about. There are reasons why one makes the calculation this way. There are also reasons why one makes the calculation. When to call the molad hamatzua 10, 12, 793. There's a calculation, but it comes out that way. The same thing here, there's a calculation that says what one should do.

According to how the Rambam says it, everything is pure calculations, perhaps the Raavad holds differently, but according to how the Rambam says it, it's not that afterwards one adds discretion, that's what I want to bring out. The whole thing is a calculation, it's one hundred percent, that is, deterministic, there's no side that sometimes one should do differently.

That is, one can say that the calculation is different. There was, there was once a dispute in Judaism, and how the laws of the calculation are. The calculations are calculations. If you know the three chapters, you know when Rosh Chodesh will be, every Rosh Chodesh in history until Mashiach will come and go back to doing it according to witnesses. These are rules, everything is rules in the laws of calculation. So that's what I'm explaining.

Summary: The Three Steps of Calendar Calculation

Speaker 1:

The first chapter we learned, step 1, the calculation has several steps. Step 1, one must know the molad hamatzua, one knows that. One knows when the molad of Rosh Hashanah of this year is, according to what the Rambam calculated all the calculations that come to know when the molad of Rosh Hashanah is.

Now, but you shouldn't make, you are indeed here, not what one was accustomed. By default, when there isn't one of the exceptions that we're now going to learn, do you make that day Rosh Hashanah? Not the next day by that, that day. That day,

that day, not any next day, that day. Again. The normal, we'll already see the main custom, I'll say.

When you know when the molad is, if there isn't one of the rules here, you make that day Rosh Hashanah. Afterwards you must add a bunch of laws that we're going to learn in this chapter, which make Rosh Hashanah not that day when the molad is, but the next day or two days later, we'll see exactly. And after the whole thing you must know, you'll already know when Rosh Chodesh is of each year.

After the third step is, learning chapter 8, you'll know when to make Rosh Chodesh of each month of that entire year. According to laws, rules, also fixed rules, never changing from the next chapter, and now you have a complete calendar. That is, the three chapters are enough to know how to make the calendar. It's very simple, doesn't take any time, and that's what one learns. So, let's learn it. Good. Halacha 1 of chapter 7. Yes, it can be.

Halacha 1: Lo Adu Rosh

Speaker 1:

The Rambam says, **"One never establishes Rosh Chodesh Tishrei according to this calculation"**, according to the previous calculation from the previous chapter, when the molad happens, that day should be the head of the new month. But, he says, when it's Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, one doesn't establish according to this calculation on the following days. One doesn't establish **"on the first day of the week"**, Sunday, **"nor on the fourth day of the week nor on erev Shabbos"**. **A sign for them**, what's the sign? **Adu**. And for this there's the sign **"Lo adu rosh"**. People know this phrase, that the days of Sunday, the fourth day - Wednesday, and Friday, are not the days of Rosh Chodesh Tishrei.

Rather if it will come out on those days, **"but when the molad of Tishrei falls on one of these three days"**, if molad Tishrei will indeed fall on adu, on one of these days, one postpones Rosh Chodesh, **"one establishes Rosh Chodesh on the day after it"**. One says that the next day is Rosh Chodesh, not that day.

He says, **"How so? If the molad was on the first day of the week, one establishes Rosh Chodesh Tishrei on the second. And if the molad will be on the fourth, one establishes Rosh Chodesh on the fifth. And if the molad will be on the sixth, one establishes Rosh Chodesh on the seventh"**. One always postpones it by one day.

Discussion: The Source of the Sign "Edua Harosh"

Very good. I must say what I saw, everyone brings here, I don't know where the... I mean that the language "lo adu rosh" doesn't appear in the Gemara, right? I remember, he says that the sign comes from a verse. We are a bunch of amei ha'aretz (ignoramuses) who don't know verses in Ezra, we think one must say "lo adu rosh."

But in the Book of Ezra it says, chapter 8 verse 17, it says **"va'atzaveh osam al Iddo harosh"**. That's when it lists there the list of the heads of the exile that Ezra brought up to Eretz Yisrael. One of them, the head of some group of Jews, was called Iddo - alef, dalet, vav at the beginning, and Ezra called him and gave him some job there.

So, comes a hint, if it says "Iddo harosh," it comes out that Rosh Hashanah is not Iddo the head. Somehow he sinned, this Iddo, that he's not the head. So that's the sign. So it comes out one must say "lo Edua rosh," not "lo adu rosh."

Which is sometimes a wonder, which I don't know, perhaps the grammarians know, when people see a word without vowels, and you're supposed to make, and you're reading it, it's suggested that the vav is a melupam, perhaps many people. It can be exactly so. Okay, usually a vav is a shuruk, but... or usually many times. Or I'm explaining the sign, it's a nice thing. Anyway, that's the rule.

Note: The Rule is Specific to the Month of Tishrei

And I must only say, the sign is only on Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, right? There are those who say, I saw, we'll see later when we speak about the reasons, seemingly the reasons that exist for this are relevant mainly to the month of Tishrei, because of Rosh Hashanah and Hoshana Rabbah, Yom Kippur and so forth. But on the other hand... say it out, right? What? Say it out.

No, no, I want to speak about that later. I just want to say, because we're holding. On the other hand, I don't understand why people say this. That is, regarding later the reason will be, we'll understand what's being said better. But... actually, the entire calendar is calculated from the month of Tishrei. That is, technically, let's say there are other reasons why it shouldn't be, because you can make the rules in the month of Kislev, or other rules that come out so that the calculation we need to have should work, but the calendar we start from Tishrei, that's how our calendar goes.

So then one makes it so it should work according to the reasons that the Rambam will say why we need to have. So one must already come to the reason that it's relevant to Rosh Hashanah specifically, it's not any... I mean to say before that only Rosh Hashanah, it's the first month. Started and said.

Introduction: Rosh Hashanah and Rosh Chodesh

Speaker 1: But it's not that Rosh Hashanah is a calendar law. On the other hand you're right, but Rosh Hashanah itself is a law in Rosh Chodesh, yes, in the section on holidays. In the tractate Rosh Hashanah stands Laws of Sanctifying the New Month. It also seems, it's very interesting.

Although people like to say that there are several Rosh Hashanahs, mainly one must count Nissan as the first month. The calendar doesn't hold that way, it goes from Tishrei, and the tractate Rosh Hashanah doesn't hold that way. Because there's no problem with the verse **"hachodesh hazeh lachem rosh chadashim, rishon hu lachem l'chodshei hashanah"**. So it can be that Rosh Hashanah is like the Rosh Chodesh of all months. It's the Rosh Chodesh of all Rosh Chodesh days.

In any case, there the year begins. No, because from Rosh Chodesh one can calculate all the moladot of the year. No, any month of Tishrei, you'll know from there. It's automatic. After what one makes... That is, one could have laid down any month a rule. But once one laid down the rule of Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, the remaining rules follow automatically if one follows the rules that will be in the next chapter.

So this is the first rule, if it's adu, one postpones Rosh Chodesh Tishrei by a day.

Meaning of "One Doesn't Establish" – Revealing the Matter

I must just throw in that in the Gemara it seems there are reasons why we don't want Rosh Hashanah to be on these days, because of Yom Kippur and because of Hoshana Rabbah,

but the Rambam wants to give it calculations. The Rambam will say the reason later.

I just want to say one more important thing here, that... what did I want to say? I forgot. Ah, I'll say clearly, because this is already anticipating what we're going to see then.

When it says here "one doesn't establish," it doesn't mean to say that someone stands and establishes. That is, the Rambam holds that technically, in learning, the beis din of Klal Yisrael makes the calculation and according to that they establish. But "one doesn't establish" means in total, if you want to make a calendar, make the calculation of this molad, add the rules to know when Rosh Hashanah is. But it's not the simple meaning that there's something that one must establish besides this. It's not something that's extra from simply knowing when Rosh Hashanah will be.

And not about this, one must also know, not about this will it ever come out that one adds another day to the month of Elul. The calculation already works that according to the rules... Elul always has 29 days in our calendar. Why? According to the rules that we're going to learn in chapter 8. This is in total to know which day will be Rosh Hashanah.

Speaker 2: You say, "Hey, can you know from the previous year and calculate this?"

Speaker 1: I don't know. Do you understand what I'm asking? The answer is, I don't know. But this is a law in Rosh Hashanah, especially with the sugya (talmudic passage) of the Gemara. The reasons are for Tishrei, the reasons are relevant to the holidays of Tishrei. Perhaps that's the reason. I'm asking a question, perhaps that's actually very difficult.

We're going to learn in the next chapter that there are rules... yes, according to the rules, from the previous year's Rosh Hashanah one can already know when next year's Rosh Hashanah will be. So one seemingly never needs to know the rules that are in this chapter. But perhaps it means that that was calculated according to this. Right, taking the thing into account.

But it's interesting, you say "one doesn't establish" isn't a command on a certain person. For example, when one sanctified according to witnesses, there was a whole drama who it is, the Sanhedrin, the Sages in Eretz Yisrael. The calendar, it never says, Rabbi Chaim Kanievsky doesn't issue a calendar. It's always some individual who is very strong in calculations.

Speaker 2: Right, it's only a revealing of the matter, like the Rambam.

Speaker 1: Everyone agrees that it's only a revealing of the matter, how the calendar should be. One must know the basics. I'm not a proclaimed copier of a good calendar, but when he wants to make a calendar and calculate things, yes. But it's not a thing.

Postponements and Sanctification According to Witnesses

There's a dispute. Simply, the postponements weren't in the time when one sanctified according to witnesses, because then one must go with the sighting. This is only a law in the calculation. There are those who say that when one sanctified according to witnesses, the beis din had power, that they could accept or not accept testimony. They could choose to be strict with the testimony.

Speaker 2: He says that when one does it according to this calculation. How does it say?

Speaker 1: Okay, it's not a contradiction investigation, because... but yes. That's one thing.

Halacha 7 (Continued): Postponement of Molad Zaken – Molad That Falls at Noon or After Noon

Speaker 1: "And likewise, if the molad will be at midday or later than midday" – another day when we don't make Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, **"And likewise, if the molad will be at midday or later than midday"**. If the molad happens already from the middle of the day, when normally one would say, there's no difference when in the day the molad is, that day is Rosh Chodesh. But for Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, if the molad happens at midday or after, **"then we establish Rosh Chodesh on the day after it"** – we also postpone it, except for lo adu rosh. So we already have a fourth reason, we have here either a fourth or a second reason why to make Rosh Chodesh a day later, if the molad was during the day.

"How so? If the molad was on Monday", not on Sunday, but on Monday when it is yes, according to the previous rule one can make it, but there is the reason that it is **"six hours into the day or more"**, at six hours, **"then we also establish Rosh Chodesh on Tuesday"**.

But **"if the molad was before midday, even by one chelek"**, even just a drop, one of the parts of one thousand and eighty chalakim. **"Before midday, then we establish Rosh Chodesh on that very day of the molad"**. Of course, **"provided that day is not one of the days Sunday, Wednesday, or Friday"**. If it's not from the adu, adu you say, if it's other days, then, if it's before half the day, yes.

Discussion: Midday and Statistical Probability

Speaker 2: They're holding us already, seemingly by now it's already most of the time. It means, if every molad can be at any part of the day, you'll already have taken away approximately half, yes? I have no idea. So except for the adu? Okay. I don't know. One needs to know when the molad usually occurs, I have no idea. Yes.

Combination of Two Postponements – Postponing by Two Days

Speaker 1: The Rambam says, what happens when there's a third clash, and the molad should have been Tuesday afternoon. And what then in such a case we postpone it to the next day, but the next day is Wednesday, the fourth day, and it can't be adu rosh. What do we do then?

The Rambam says, **"that the molad will be at midday or after midday, and the day after it will begin"**. **"If the day after it will be on the days of adu"**, if the day after comes out on the days when we can't make Rosh Chodesh as the first reason of adu, **"behold it is postponed to the day after the day after"**, we postpone it by two days, **"and Rosh Chodesh will be established on the third day from the day of the molad"**.

"How so? Behold if the molad was on Shabbos at midday", the sign is 7-18. Why 18? 7 is Shabbos. 18, midday. Midday is the eighteenth hour from the beginning of the day which begins at sunset. It's six o'clock at night. So midday we're talking about here midday of the day. It comes out the eighteenth hour from the night before. 18 from... right. Midday

is always hour 18 of the day. Six hours into the day, but with the night it's 18, and all day calculations go with the twenty-four.

"Then we can't make it the next day because it would be Sunday. We establish Rosh Chodesh in a year whose molad is like this on Monday", we make it on Monday, so we've postponed by two days.

The Rebbe is incredibly lengthy, with his examples, everything is extremely simple books. **"And likewise"**, the same thing.

Discussion: Effect on the Previous Year

Speaker 2: But actually, this will add to the previous year another two days, yes?

Speaker 1: It never adds to the previous year in practice, because the calculation is already set. Because the calendar is already set.

Speaker 2: But how will it still be 29?

Speaker 1: Ah, because all the months were set up that match with this. Right, that is... But it means that someone would have known when Rosh Hashanah will be.

Speaker 2: Right, if someone would have learned the Rambam and he would have made a calendar after each chapter, yes? Would he after this chapter have made a calendar that would come out thirty-one days.

Speaker 1: What will he think from the adu rosh? No, it wouldn't come out. It's a given that it won't come out. I know. Okay.

"And likewise if the molad was on Tuesday at midday or after midday", if the reason is... and it's on Tuesday after midday, when we can't make the day after on Wednesday, **"it turns out that Rosh Chodesh is on Thursday"**.

The Rambam says, up until now this is like a second reason why we make Rosh Chodesh, and sometimes the first two can combine, so it comes out two days that we postpone Rosh Chodesh from the molad.

Law 8: Postponement of Gatrad – Molad Tishrei in a Simple Year

And after that there is another type of reason that has to do with the year. The Rambam doesn't say why, so we can learn as it's written.

"The molad of Tishrei that comes out in this calculation", with the calculation he says, **"will come out on Tuesday night, at nine hours into the night from its beginning and forty chalakim from the tenth hour"**, the sign is gatrad, so again, nine hours, ah, gimmel, the third day, the ninth hour, and two hundred and four chalakim, **"or more"**, this or later than this, **"if it was a simple year"**. There is if the previous year was a simple year, not a leap year.

Discussion: What Does "Simple Year" Mean in This Context

Speaker 2: What does the previous year mean? The molad happens after a year from a simple year, yes? We're talking here about the molad of the new year. The next year. If it was a simple year means the year Tishrei that we're entering now?

Speaker 1: That's what I think... But it's not relevant, they're both in the same year with respect to Nisan. Simple year, when the last Nisan wasn't... Simple year is always a thing... When we reckon here simple year, we mean the year from Tishrei to Tishrei, and we're holding in the middle. And we know what Nisan was, the last Nisan was a simple year, because the last one he says motza'ei me'uberet. It means the first year after the leap year.

I think that simple means that the year that will come, that is it begins from Tishrei, will be me'uber. That's what I think. It's interesting, the simple year we reckon from Tishrei to Tishrei. All years will be from Tishrei Tishrei, everything. Yes, yes. I think it means that the year that begins now, which we're judging now when to begin Rosh Hashanah. If Rosh Hashanah is simple, and the molad came out after such and such hours, we also postpone Rosh Chodesh. And instead of it being that same day Tuesday, we postpone it, and we also postpone it by two days. In this case we always postpone it by two days, because the third day is always a day before the fourth, and in such a case Rosh Chodesh will also be two days later on Thursday. This is number three when we postpone Rosh Chodesh.

Postponement of Btu Takpat (Postponement #4)

Speaker 1: Okay, the year that begins now, which we're judging now when to begin Rosh Hashanah. If Rosh Hashanah is simple, and the molad came out after such and such hours, we also postpone Rosh Chodesh. And instead of it being that same day Tuesday, we postpone it, and we also postpone it by two days. In this case we always postpone it by two days, because the third day is always a day before the fourth, and in such a case Rosh Chodesh will also be two days later on Thursday. This is number three when we postpone Rosh Chodesh.

Another case, the fourth case is, **and likewise if the molad of Tishrei comes out on Monday, at three hours into the day, and five hundred and eighty-nine chalakim**, a day earlier, on Monday, the fourth hour, and the sign this time will be 2, the second day of the day, 15. Btu takpat. One must always say the signs with a...

Speaker 2: Good, but what is the 15? 2 three hours, right? Three hours into the day is the fifteenth hour.

Speaker 1: Ah, the fifteenth hour we say. Three hours into the day is the fifteenth hour, just like before.

Speaker 2: Oh, now it will go later than that.

Speaker 1: And here we're talking about something else, umotza hashanah motza hame'uberet. It means, we're talking here about the first simple year, but it's the simple year after the leap year. It means, the previous Nisan was me'uber. The year that we're coming from now. She'oseh hashanah hasmuchah lah she'avrah me'uberet, is very good. Then in such a case Rosh Chodesh on Monday in this year, but on Tuesday the day we postpone it by one day. We say that we have four reasons when we postpone. Very good. Very good. Very good.

The Rule of One Chelek

The Rambam says further. But this is only when it's exactly the gatrad or the btu takpat. Even if it's missing just one chelek, for example if it was the sign of gatrad, if less than this we establish it on Tuesday. And likewise if the molad of motza'ei me'uberet was less by one chelek, for example if its sign was btu takpach instead of takpat, if less than this we also establish it on Monday.

Summary of All Postponements – How to Establish Rosh Chodesh Tishrei

It comes out, in total, if you want to know when Rosh Chodesh Tishrei is, this is what you need to do. Yes, he says, **and anyone who wants to know the way of establishing Rosh Chodesh Tishrei according to this calculation should do thus**, when someone wants to establish Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, he needs to check, **he should calculate and know the molad on which day**, learn chapter 6 and learn when the molad comes out, **and how many hours from the day or from the night and how many chalakim from the hour**, how many hours and how many chalakim. **And the day of the molad is always the day of establishment**, the day of the molad is always the day from which one establishes. Usually the day of the molad is always the day of establishment.

However but here by Rosh Chodesh Tishrei one needs to look at the four postponements. **However if it was on Sunday or on Wednesday or on Friday, or if the molad was at midday or after midday, or if the molad was at the fourth hour and six hundred and forty-two chalakim from Tuesday night of a simple year**, as we said before the rule, batrad, yes, what was it called, **or if the molad was at five hundred and ninety-eight chalakim from the fourth hour of Monday of a simple year that is after the leap year**, btu takpat. If it doesn't have one of these things, then the molad establishes and on that day becomes Rosh Chodesh. **But if one of these four things occurs, we don't establish on the day of the molad but on the day after it or the day after that as we explained**.

The Reason for Lo Adu Rosh

He's going to say the reason for one of the four things. There are four reasons, both have reasons, perhaps it's too complicated to explain, and we learned yesterday that the Rambam wants to make it simple. The point here is to make a calendar, the point is not here to learn depths of why the calendar is so, that's good for people who want to have time, the point here is to make a calendar, and that's enough and more.

It seems however by the adu rosh it seems something strange, just Rosh Hashanah can't be Sunday, why can't Rosh Hashanah be Sunday? The Rambam adds something, the Rambam also has an interest in teaching that the calculation is not the true calculation of the Holy One Blessed be He, later he goes from the true conjunction, so he found an opportunity to talk about this. But the other things also have a reason, but everyone who looks, sees that there's some precise calculation, understands that there's some reason why so. That's what I think.

Discussion: Does the Gemara Talk About This

Speaker 2: I think that when the Gemara says the reasons why lo adu, does the Gemara mean already after the calculation of the Rambam? Why did one make all these things not the opposite? You're jumping, you're jumping. We should make half the days this way and half the days that way.

Speaker 1: Rabbeinu, go from here.

Speaker 2: Very good.

Speaker 1: That the Rambam didn't answer, that's not answered. But he relies that whoever wants can look in the Gemara, but the Gemara does have reasons.

Speaker 2: It doesn't say in the Gemara doesn't argue with the Gemara.

Speaker 1: One minute, it doesn't say in the Gemara any reasons for this.

Speaker 2: I just need to say very clearly. Maybe, but go in order. The Gemara says yes, the Gemara says that we have because of...

Speaker 1: It says, we're not talking about this. Let's go in order. It's not at all true that the Gemara talks about this, even the Ra'avad doesn't claim that the Gemara talks about this, but you're jumping, we're learning with people, nobody knows what you're talking about. You need to explain what the Ra'avad said. But finish, let's finish the Rambam's reason, because he says another law, and after that we'll see what the Ra'avad says about this.

The Rambam's Approach That All Postponements Stem From the Same Principle

The Rambam's Proof and the Raavad's Critique

The Rambam says, **"and the essence of these other four dechiyos (postponements)"**, what about all the other four dechiyos? Is this the nechtzos (necessities) or the other ones? It's a simple Mishnah already, it's incomprehensible. The Rambam says, **"this is the principle that we stated, that this calculation is the average motion"**, that the calculation is the average motion, therefore one must fix it with all these ways. This is what the Rambam argues.

That is, it appears the Rambam holds yes, he said it and didn't explain how, what does it matter to me that there will be a molad zaken etc. But apparently, the Rambam comes to answer a different question. That is, he comes to answer perhaps as you said earlier, perhaps the opposite.

The Rambam's Proof That the Dechiyos Bring Us Closer to the True Molad

Speaker 1: He wants to say, how can you change if the molad is today? What does it mean you push it off? The Rambam says, no, the molad is not today. On the contrary, all these fixes are in order to make the molad closer to Rosh Chodesh. I don't know when it would have been without mitui (averaging) one could have played around, but since it is average, must be mezuman (appointed), yes, very good. Both may and must be mezuman. Right.

"And proof of the matter", a proof that this is the reason for the dechiyos in order to arrive closer to the true motion, **"for behold the molad will be on Tuesday night"**. Because the molad that we calculate, the average, comes out many times on Tuesday night, **"and it will be postponed to Thursday"**. I said it's difficult with the calculation, **"and sometimes many times the moon will be on Thursday night"**.

Many times, when one goes to make Rosh Chodesh, let's say Rosh Chodesh Tishrei, many times it comes out Tuesday night, as long as it's still before the fourth hour of the day, yes, but the fourth hour of the day we push it off by two days. And then, that year, it's already Wednesday. And look at that year when one sees the moon, you will see, many times, even Wednesday night one still doesn't see it. You will see on Thursday night, and not only that, you won't see it. So you see that what you thought it should be on Tuesday night is still three days before the actual moon.

So you see that our molad is not a final indication of the moon, and not only that and not on Friday night, sometimes one

won't see it on Friday night. It comes out three days after what you thought the molad was. It can't be, a day or two after the molad one should certainly already be able to see the moon. In general, and from this you see that **"the sun and moon did not truly conjoin, but rather on Thursday"**, they only truly came together on Thursday.

And precisely because we make all these dechiyos, we become closer to the reality. The gap should become smaller. That is, without this the gap would become bigger and bigger, yes? Because one would always be running with a... yes, I don't know if it would work, because every year is a new calculation.

How One Makes a Calendar – The General Rule

Speaker 1: In any case, you must remember that the average calculation is accurate after a whole year. After a whole year it is accurate. It only runs off from that by two.

Speaker 2: No.

Speaker 1: No, no, I want to say very clearly what this calculation is. I remember, how does one make a calculation? Let's say the rule that the Rambam says, which I know for certain. How does one make a calendar? A calendar is made fresh every year, okay? One doesn't calculate what was last year, not all the dechiyos. One calculates what was the molad from molad BeHaRaD. Or if you know, last year you can add according to the calculations that we learned in the previous chapter. But that is also built on the same calculation of the molad that goes from the year of tohu, from the six days of creation, goes 29 12 793, a month and a month.

So every year one calculates again. After one knows when is the molad of the year, you add the dechiyos to know when Rosh Hashanah of the year will be. So it can never be according to any of the rules that Rosh Hashanah next year will be three days later.

The Difference Between True Molad and Average Molad – Only Between Months, Not Years

Speaker 1: Now, secondly, that which the true molad is different from the average molad, is a thing only throughout the year, not after a whole year it certainly comes back correctly. Why? Because the difference of the true molad and the average molad is a difference between months, not a difference between years. In other words, the calculation on the year is an average of one year. This is how I understand what the commentators told you.

That is, you take together the twelve months of a year, it comes out exactly. The lunar year that was learned, three hundred fifty-four and ten, whatever the number is, I don't remember anymore, is exact. The calculation of the year is exact. And only the calculation of the month is not exact. Why? Because the moon doesn't travel every month exactly the same. And in Nissan it's a bit long, shorter, and so on. I don't know with the moon's own extra I don't know what it has to do with, because now one doesn't learn it now.

I'm telling you that the difference is only between months. So the problem is only that Rosh Hashanah, which is already in the middle of the years, then the moon doesn't travel exactly on the calculation, then it can come out that the moon one will see much after Rosh Chodesh, therefore one pushes off Rosh Chodesh. But it's not that the whole calculation will be ruined, only the month will be ruined. Right?

Speaker 2: Ah, interesting.

Speaker 1: In any case, the Rambam is only proving here what? That the dechiyos are not from the true molad, because you see that one doesn't see the moon even four days after that, and that can't be if the conjunction wasn't. Rather what, no, the conjunction was on Thursday, it actually makes sense that one should make Rosh Hashanah on the day of the conjunction.

Eh, Rosh Hashanah should have been with the sighting? Okay, we go with the calculation.

What Is Meant When the Molad Is Announced in Shul

Speaker 1: And here comes the Raavad. Now the Raavad says like this, on this whole law, the previous law, on law 7, the Raavad says like this – I'm not taking any position on the sharp language, I'm just saying, God forbid, who am I, I am dust – the Raavad says like this: **"Abraham said, because this author is very guarded and boasts in this wisdom, and in his eyes he has reached its ultimate."** In his eyes he looks as if he has reached the peak of this wisdom.

"And I am not from the people of the wisdom of astronomy, for even my teachers did not reach it." He says such an "we and our fathers have sinned," he shears the blames. He says, I'm not a great expert in calculations, I can't enter into his subtle calculations. **"But I did not enter into his words to examine the matter,"** I didn't go in to check if his calculations are correct. Not once will he tell him, I'm sure his calculations are good. He says, I don't know, I can't check him.

In short, he positions himself as if on the assumption, as always I have objections, here I perhaps also could have had objections, but I didn't do it. If the Raavad has on almost every law an objection, can there be a whole law where there isn't a single one? There are nineteen chapters in Kiddush HaChodesh? There isn't a whole, among the nineteen whole chapters that the Raavad has nothing to say? It can't be. Rather what? He can't. He didn't learn this topic.

How will the Raavad have his objections? I learned the Gemara, and it doesn't fit. I have a different reasoning. He didn't know the Gemara of this subject. So how should he say objections?

The Raavad's Objection – The First Question

Speaker 1: "But when I encountered this thing that he wrote, it was wondrous in my eyes, a wonder of wonders," fine, it became a great wonder. Baruch Hashem, I found a question to ask on the Rambam, that he asks, according to the calculation that the Rambam says that we must push off, we must make sometimes Rosh Hashanah should be later, because we see that the true molad is a bit later, as the Rambam said here at the end, he says, if so, why shouldn't one also do it when Rosh Chodesh Tishrei should be 2, 3, 5, 7? Why 4, 1, 4, 6?

According to him one would never have had to be established on the day of the molad, one would always have had to push off to go in a day. **"And what sin did Adam the first, and what sin did Adu that the molad should never be in it forever?"** You see, I think he goes with the Raavad that ADU is a certain person. **"And what sin did ADU that the molad should never be in it truly, forever it will be postponed? And what merit did BeGaHaZ have that it should be in it and not be postponed?"** You catch that the Raavad, with all due respect to the Raavad, his questions...

The Raavad's Objection – The Second Question

Speaker 2: No, I think his main question is later. His main question is apparently... both.

Speaker 1: He asks a question, he goes like this, the Rambam comes here like that one... I think the Rambam understood the point well. That is, the Rambam wants to teach us here that the calculation that you say on Rosh Chodesh, the molad will be... you do everything with the molad, the Rambam holds in one go, average in the ear. This is only the molad here an average. A kind of mitzvah, it's not the real molad. The moon doesn't have to follow your molad that you announce at all.

Yes, why does one announce the molad in shul? Because Rosh Chodesh goes according to this. It's not that which one announces the molad, not that one should be able to search for the moon, it's that one should know when Rosh Chodesh is. Why one announces it every month I don't know, because one can announce, gentlemen, remember last month was the molad, and make yourselves the calculation. It's not your burden here.

Speaker 2: No, it's only relevant for Rosh Hashanah, because all other months one doesn't come when the molad was. It becomes automatically after Rosh Hashanah, true.

Speaker 1: And the interesting thing is, Rosh Hashanah is the one time that one doesn't announce any molad, one doesn't do any Rosh Chodesh blessing. So, in short, one can't make any aliyah, because one doesn't announce it.

So, the Raavad asks, the Rambam says that the molad is not true, it comes later. This is every year one must push it off. This is as if what he asks. The Rambam comes out somehow that only if it's exactly, if it's by ADU where, then he is meritorious, then by him the average motion becomes closer with the true motion. Yes, and he asks as if, is there some rule that ADU where is never not, the true molad never doesn't fit? What does it have to do with?

And the second question he asks, and I think we can answer both questions. He says, **"and I have received"** it says in the Gemara that the postponement of the fourth is not for another reason.

Speaker 2: No, no, no, okay. I was in general, I was in general, the rabbi shouldn't teach me out, that the postponement of the fourth is because of the day of Aravah because of the day of Aravah, that the rabbis' decrees shouldn't happen on Shabbos, so that one should be able to make the order, one should be able to make Hoshanos and everything.

Speaker 1: No, you shouldn't be docheh Shabbos. And because of Yom Kippur that it should not come neither on Friday nor on Saturday night, that Yom Kippur shouldn't come out Friday or Saturday night, would have been very difficult. What would have been difficult? One wouldn't have been able to make vegetables, whatever, one wouldn't have been able to prepare properly Friday. If Yom Kippur is Friday one can't prepare properly, one can't cook for Shabbos. If Yom Kippur is Saturday night, also not, one can't prepare, fast the clock.

In short, the dechiyos 2, 4, 6 is because of 1, 4, 6. What is the dechiyos 2, 4, 6? I don't know. I also don't know. I think he means Pesach, but I don't know what he wants from this. Because it comes out that also not on 4, 6 Pesach.

Speaker 2: Ah, that Pesach also comes out according to this order. Not on 4, 6, not according to this order. Meaning, instead of 1, because Pesach doesn't come out Sunday anyway.

Speaker 1: No, Sunday it can be.

Speaker 2: Ah, instead of 1 is 2. Okay.

Speaker 1: I don't know what he wants but from this. This is what he asks on the Rambam. Right.

A Proposal to Answer Both Questions

Speaker 1: But I think that... I would have said like this, that the Rambam... tell me if it fits. The Rambam says that one doesn't have to always push off, it's only enough that half of all times, or let's say a bit more than half. Let's say it comes out 70%.

The Raavad's Critique "You Have Not Reached Its Ultimate" — A Deeper Analysis

And the reason why ADU, on this it already says in the Gemara good reasons about Yom Kippur and about the day of Aravah. Why one took the random three days instead of the other random three days is for the reason.

I think the Raavad is essentially, he says **"you have not reached its ultimate"**, what he means here to grasp is, he means to say that he doesn't trust so strongly the Rambam who says that the molad is not the molad. He doesn't know any stories of true molad, he never heard of it. You see that the Gemara that one only goes ADU, rather what the reason is in general something else, it has nothing to do with this thing, the whole thing.

And one can reconcile both by saying that one needs half the time, as the rabbi says. Which half can one not find just reasons, as the rabbi says? The rabbi says, the rabbi says, we don't disagree with this that one must find reasons why exactly these three. I agree. But on the other hand, and on the other hand, I only need to say one thing.

The Difference Between the Gemara's Context and the Rambam's Calendar System

That which the Rav says we have received, the whole world all commentators say that in the Gemara it says that one used to make Elul intercalary because of vegetables, because of corpses, vegetables means Rosh Hashanah, Yom Kippur, one shouldn't be able to have any vegetables, or about a corpse, it should be three full days, two days should be, yes? Or as the Gemara sees about the day of Aravah also perhaps. That is, it says in the Gemara that someone said to the fixers of the calendar that it should make sure that the day of Aravah shouldn't come out on Shabbos.

The Main Innovation: The Gemara Speaks of a Completely Different Matter

But one must know that the Gemara doesn't speak of what we're speaking. That is, it can be a nice reasoning to say that the same reasoning is for the rule. But what the Gemara speaks of is when one used to fulfill by sighting, and you see with the point that we learned in the previous chapters, that sometimes even when one is sanctifying by sighting one can make the month late for certain reasons. One can already play around if it falls out, and this is the reason to play around and make the month late. Yes, one pushes off, one hears it noble only later, whatever the answer is, and for these reasons.

But it doesn't say in the Gemara about the calendar. What we're speaking of is rules, which is not what the Gemara still speaks of. The Rambam is not a contradiction in the Gemara, I think the Rambam also admits.

How the Rambam Uses the Gemara's Reasonings

It's very nice, it can be that the Rambam has as if... we need anyway to make that it should fit, so one will use as much as one can from the same things from the Gemara. One wants to bridge the Gemara. In the Gemara's times there wasn't this problem, because the Gemara didn't make any molad at all.

Yes, but once we saw that these days can't come out Rosh Hashanah, it's very appropriate. One can still say your thing, but... they only understand that the Gemara doesn't speak of what the Rambam speaks. It's not a contradiction of the Rambam in the Gemara.

Discussion: The Raavad's Claim and the Rambam's "We Have Received"

Speaker 1: What is a contradiction, the Rambam says we have received, your rabbi explained it to him. Actually as you say, that we continue the Gemara's reasonings, but it's not... I saw others write as if the Raavad says that it says in the Gemara.

Speaker 2: The Raavad doesn't say that it says in the Gemara, it says in the Gemara, it says in the Gemara, but the Gemara doesn't speak about this. Both did something similar to the Gemara, the rabbis of the Raavad and the Rambam. Both took the words, the literal words of the Gemara and changed it, but kept the same rule that these days don't happen Rosh Hashanah.

But the Rambam doesn't go with the Gemara at all.

Speaker 1: No, true, because the Rambam doesn't say that one actually pushes off Rosh Hashanah, only one controls the calendar this way.

Speaker 2: But yes.

Speaker 1: No. It's not... in other words one doesn't make Elul intercalary.

Speaker 2: No. He says, the Gemara speaks that sometimes Elul is thirty days because of this. But... the Rambam doesn't speak of making Elul intercalary, he speaks separately from the calendar should say which day is Rosh Hashanah.

I'm lucky not to make Elul intercalary today, because the Lithuanians would certainly have made Elul intercalary every year. It can catch a few more days of Elul, no?

Speaker 1: Already. This is the point.

Speaker 2: Okay.

Speaker 1: Okay. Until we come to chapter 7.